

NIST Internal Report NIST IR 8505 ipd

# A Data Protection Approach for Cloud-Native Applications

**Initial Public Draft** 

Ramaswamy Chandramouli Wesley Hales

This publication is available free of charge from: https://doi.org/10.6028/NIST.IR.8505.ipd



# NIST Internal Report NIST IR 8505 ipd

# A Data Protection Approach for Cloud-Native Applications

**Initial Public Draft** 

Ramaswamy Chandramouli Computer Security Division Information Technology Laboratory

> Wesley Hales Leak Signal Inc.

This publication is available free of charge from: https://doi.org/10.6028/NIST.IR.8505.ipd

June 2024



U.S. Department of Commerce *Gina M. Raimondo, Secretary* 

National Institute of Standards and Technology Laurie E. Locascio, NIST Director and Under Secretary of Commerce for Standards and Technology NIST IR 8505 ipd (Initial Public Draft) June 2024

Certain equipment, instruments, software, or materials, commercial or non-commercial, are identified in this paper in order to specify the experimental procedure adequately. Such identification does not imply recommendation or endorsement of any product or service by NIST, nor does it imply that the materials or equipment identified are necessarily the best available for the purpose.

There may be references in this publication to other publications currently under development by NIST in accordance with its assigned statutory responsibilities. The information in this publication, including concepts and methodologies, may be used by federal agencies even before the completion of such companion publications. Thus, until each publication is completed, current requirements, guidelines, and procedures, where they exist, remain operative. For planning and transition purposes, federal agencies may wish to closely follow the development of these new publications by NIST.

Organizations are encouraged to review all draft publications during public comment periods and provide feedback to NIST. Many NIST cybersecurity publications, other than the ones noted above, are available at <a href="https://csrc.nist.gov/publications">https://csrc.nist.gov/publications</a>.

### **NIST Technical Series Policies**

Copyright, Use, and Licensing Statements NIST Technical Series Publication Identifier Syntax

### **Publication History**

Approved by the NIST Editorial Review Board on YYYY-MM-DD [Will be added to final publication]

### How to Cite this NIST Technical Series Publication

Chandramouli R, Hales W (2024) A Data Protection Approach for Cloud-Native Applications. (National Institute of Standards and Technology, Gaithersburg, MD), NIST Interagency or Internal Report (IR) NIST IR 8505 ipd. https://doi.org/10.6028/NIST.IR.8505.ipd

### Author ORCID iDs

Ramaswamy Chandramouli: 0000-0002-7387-5858

### Public Comment Period

June 14, 2024 – August 1, 2024

Submit Comments nistir-8505-comments@nist.gov

National Institute of Standards and Technology Attn: Computer Security Division, Information Technology Laboratory 100 Bureau Drive (Mail Stop 8930) Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8930

All comments are subject to release under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA).

### 1 Abstract

- 2 This document addresses the need for effective data protection strategies in the evolving realm
- 3 of cloud-native network architectures, including multi-cloud environments, service mesh
- 4 networks, and hybrid infrastructures. By extending foundational data categorization concepts,
- 5 it provides a framework for aligning data protection approaches with the unknowns of data in
- 6 transit. Specifically, it explores service mesh architecture, leveraging and emphasizing the
- 7 capabilities of WebAssembly (WASM) in ensuring robust data protection as sensitive data is
- 8 transmitted through east-west and north-south communication paths.

### 9 Keywords

- 10 data governance; data privacy; data protection; data security; in-transit data categorization;
- 11 WASM.

## 12 Reports on Computer Systems Technology

- 13 The Information Technology Laboratory (ITL) at the National Institute of Standards and
- 14 Technology (NIST) promotes the U.S. economy and public welfare by providing technical
- 15 leadership for the Nation's measurement and standards infrastructure. ITL develops tests, test
- 16 methods, reference data, proof of concept implementations, and technical analyses to advance
- the development and productive use of information technology. ITL's responsibilities include
- 18 the development of management, administrative, technical, and physical standards and
- 19 guidelines for the cost-effective security and privacy of other than national security-related
- 20 information in federal information systems.
- 21

### 22 Call for Patent Claims

- 23 This public review includes a call for information on essential patent claims (claims whose use
- 24 would be required for compliance with the guidance or requirements in this Information
- 25 Technology Laboratory (ITL) draft publication). Such guidance and/or requirements may be
- 26 directly stated in this ITL Publication or by reference to another publication. This call also
- 27 includes disclosure, where known, of the existence of pending U.S. or foreign patent
- 28 applications relating to this ITL draft publication and of any relevant unexpired U.S. or foreign
- 29 patents.
- ITL may require from the patent holder, or a party authorized to make assurances on its behalf,in written or electronic form, either:
- a) assurance in the form of a general disclaimer to the effect that such party does not hold
   and does not currently intend holding any essential patent claim(s); or
- b) assurance that a license to such essential patent claim(s) will be made available to
   applicants desiring to utilize the license for the purpose of complying with the guidance
   or requirements in this ITL draft publication either:
- i. under reasonable terms and conditions that are demonstrably free of any unfairdiscrimination; or
- ii. without compensation and under reasonable terms and conditions that aredemonstrably free of any unfair discrimination.
- 41 Such assurance shall indicate that the patent holder (or third party authorized to make
- 42 assurances on its behalf) will include in any documents transferring ownership of patents
- 43 subject to the assurance, provisions sufficient to ensure that the commitments in the assurance
- 44 are binding on the transferee, and that the transferee will similarly include appropriate
- 45 provisions in the event of future transfers with the goal of binding each successor-in-interest.
- 46 The assurance shall also indicate that it is intended to be binding on successors-in-interest
- 47 regardless of whether such provisions are included in the relevant transfer documents.
- 48 Such statements should be addressed to: <u>nistir-8505-comments@nist.gov</u>
- 49

# 50 Table of Contents

51	1. Introduction1				
52	1.1. Existing Approaches to Data Protection and Their Limitations1				
53	1.2. In-Proxy Application for Data Protection1				
54	1.3. Objective and Scope of This Document2				
55	1.4. Organization of This Document2				
56	2. Web Assembly Background4				
57	2.1. Origin				
58	2.2. Progression Into Server-Side Environments4				
59	2.2.1. Development and Deployment Process				
60	2.3. Proxies as WASM Platforms				
61	2.4. Proxy-WASM				
62	2.4.1. Role of WASM in Different Service Mesh Architectures7				
63	2.5. WASI-HTTP				
64	2.6. eBPF				
65	3. Data Protection in Transit9				
66	3.1. Data Categorization Techniques9				
67	3.2. Techniques for Data Protection9				
68	3.2.1. Web Traffic Data Protection9				
69	3.2.2. API Security				
70	3.2.3. Microsegmentation				
71	3.2.4. Log Traffic Data Protection11				
72	3.2.5. LLM Traffic Data Protection11				
73	3.2.6. Credit Card-Related Data Protection12				
74	3.2.7. Monitoring Tools to Visualize Sensitive Data Flows				
75	4. Security Analysis of WASM Modules13				
76	4.1. WASM Security Goals and Security Feature Sets13				
77	4.1.1. User-Level Security Features14				
78	4.1.2. Security Primitives for Developers14				
79	4.2. Memory Model and Memory Safety14				
80	4.3. Execution Model and Control Flow Integrity15				
81	4.4. Security of API Access to OS and Host Resources16				
82	4.5. Protection From Side-Channel Attacks16				
83	4.6. Protection Against Code Injection and Other Attacks16				
84	4.7. Deployment and Operating Security16				

85	5. Summary and Conclusions	18
86	References	19
87	Appendix A. Execution Model for Web Assembly in Browsers	20
88	Appendix B. Comparison of Execution Models for Containers and WASM Modules	21

### 90 1. Introduction

- 91 In the constantly evolving landscape of cloud-native application architectures, where data
- 92 resides in multiple locations (i.e., on-premises and on the cloud), ensuring data security involves
- 93 more than simply specifying and granting authorization during service requests. It also involves
- 94 a comprehensive strategy to categorize and analyze data access and leakage as data travels
- 95 across various protocols (e.g., gRPC, REST-based), especially within ephemeral and scalable
- 96 microservices applications. As organizations find themselves governing hundreds to tens of
- 97 thousands of services and the inter-service calls between them, a security void has been
- 98 identified in observing and protecting sensitive data in transit.

### 99 **1.1. Existing Approaches to Data Protection and Their Limitations**

- 100 Traditionally, regular expressions (regex) have been widely used for data categorization to
- 101 identify patterns that match predefined categories or data classes with the aid of keywords and
- validators for enhanced precision. Despite its wide adoption and usage, the approach has
- 103 notable limitations. The processing time scales linearly with data volume, making it impractical
- 104 for very large datasets. Regex also lacks the capability for logical computations, which are
- 105 necessary for complex validations like checksums in credit card numbers. Its effectiveness
- 106 heavily relies on the correct proximity to specific keywords, leading to potential false positives
- 107 and considerable noise if not managed correctly.
- 108 Machine learning (ML) offers a promising enhancement to data categorization by learning from
- 109 data patterns and improving over time, thus providing a scalable and adaptable solution. ML
- algorithms can handle both structured and unstructured data, predict data categories based on
- historical data, and adjust to new patterns without explicit reprogramming. This adaptability
- significantly reduces the time and computational resources required to manage complex
- 113 datasets and is effective for both data at rest and in motion.
- 114 To address and complement the limitations of traditional data-at-rest inventory, in-transit data
- categorization has recently come to light as the next logical step in data protection. Unlike the
- former, which only secures stored information, in-transit categorization actively monitors and
- secures data as it moves across services and network protocols. This shift to real-time data
- analysis within the network brings new observability capabilities, eliminating the need for
- 119 traffic mirroring and data duplication.

## 120 **1.2. In-Proxy Application for Data Protection**

- 121 To address the need for data categorization during travel across services, a relatively new class
- of in-proxy application called the WebAssembly program (also called a WASM module) has
- been increasingly deployed. A WASM module is a lightweight executable compiled to low-level
- 124 bytecode. This bytecode can be:
- 125 (a) Generated from code written in any language using their associated WebAssembly
- 126 compilers, including C, C++, and Rust

- (b) Run using a WASM runtime in an isolated virtual machine (VM) within the proxy, which
- allows developers to enhance applications with necessary functionality and run them asefficiently as native code in the proxies.
- 130 Over the last few years, the Envoy WASM VM has enabled new types of compute and traffic
- 131 processing capabilities and allowed for custom WASM modules to be built and deployed in a 132 sandboxed and fault-tolerant manner.
- Additionally, the following features of WebAssembly modules make them particularly effectivefor data protection:
- Data Discovery and Categorization: WASM modules can dynamically identify and categorize data as it traverses the network, ensuring that sensitive information is recognized and handled appropriately.
- Dynamic Data Masking (DDM): WASM modules can apply DDM techniques to redact or
   mask sensitive information in transit, enhancing privacy and security.
- User and Entity Behavior Analytics (UEBA): WASM modules can analyze user and entity
   behaviors in real time, detecting anomalies and potential security threats.
- Data Loss Prevention (DLP): WASM modules can enforce DLP policies by monitoring and controlling data transfers to prevent unauthorized data exfiltration.

### 144 **1.3. Objective and Scope of This Document**

- 145 All services (e.g., networking, security, monitoring, etc.) for microservices-based applications
- are provided by a centralized infrastructure called the service mesh, and the data plane for this
- 147 service mesh which performs all runtime tasks consists of proxies. This document outlines
- a practical framework for effective data protection and highlights the versatile capabilities of
- 149 WebAssembly (WASM) within service mesh architectures, multi-cloud environments, and
- 150 hybrid (i.e., a combination of on-premises and cloud-based) infrastructures. By focusing on in-
- 151 line, network traffic analysis at layers 4–7, organizations can enhance security, streamline
- 152 operations, and utilize adaptive data protection measures.

## 153 **1.4. Organization of This Document**

- 154 This document is organized as follows:
- Section 2 describes the execution environment for WASM modules in detail, including the application infrastructure (i.e., service mesh) under which it runs, the specific host environment (i.e., proxies), the process for generating bytecodes and executables, the processes for executing the modules using a WASM runtime, and an API (i.e., WASI) for accessing OS resources of the underlying platform.
- Section 3 introduces the concept of data categorization and the use of various data
   protection techniques (e.g., data masking, redaction, etc.) to ensure the security of data
   in different domains or application scenarios using WASM modules, such as web traffic

- data protection, API Security, microsegmentation, log traffic data protection, LLM traffic
   data protection, and integration with monitoring tools for the visualization of sensitive
   data flows.
- Section 4 presents a detailed security analysis of a WASM module by examining its development, deployment, and execution environment to ensure that the module satisfies the properties of a security kernel and can provide the necessary security assurance.
- Section 5 provides a summary of the topics covered in this document and discusses how
   WASM module functionality must continuously evolve to provide the security assurance
   needed to protect against data breaches and exfiltration in the context of increasingly
   sophisticated attacks on data.

### 175 **2. Web Assembly Background**

- 176 WebAssembly modules are deployed to protect data on microservices-based architectures in
- 177 which the entire application (also called a cloud-native application because of its ubiquitous
- deployment in cloud and hybrid environments) consists of several distributed, loosely coupled,
- and independently scalable components called microservices. All services for this class of
- 180 application (e.g., networking, security policies enforcement, state monitoring, configuration of
- 181 runtime parameters) are provided by a centralized application-independent service
- 182 infrastructure called the service mesh. This service mesh consists of a data plane that is
- 183 primarily made up of proxies that house the various service modules. Using the family of APIs
- 184 provided by the proxies, relevant service modules (e.g., network path determination) are
- implemented using the management/control plane of the service mesh. The WebAssembly is
- 186 one such service module ecosystem implemented in the data plane proxies of a service mesh.

### 187 2.1. Origin

- 188 WASM modules originated in browser environments and were designed to run in memory-safe
- 189 sandboxes, making them more secure than running client-side JavaScript. The execution model
- 190 for running WebAssembly code in browsers is given in Appendix A. In addition to security,
- 191 WASM modules have the following advantages [1]:
- Performance: Due to its low-level binary format targeted for modern processors, WASM modules provide near-native performance. Hence, it is considered the "fourth language" for the web alongside HTML, CSS, and JavaScript and is designed to enable high-performance applications in browsers.
- Broad support: It has broad accessibility and is supported in popular browsers, such as
   Chrome, Firefox, Edge, and Safari.

### 198 2.2. Progression Into Server-Side Environments

- 199 WASM modules progressed from browser to server environments when Mozilla introduced an
- 200 open-source project called the WebAssembly System Interface (WASI) that provided a
- 201 framework for WebAssembly apps to access operating system resources [4]. This allowed for
- 202 content delivery networks (CDNs) to use WebAssembly to deploy customers' apps without
- 203 giving them access to the underlying CDN infrastructure.

## 204 2.2.1. Development and Deployment Process

- 205 The emergence of WASM compilers for several languages enabled developers to use their
- 206 preferred languages to create server-side applications. Additionally, server-side WASM code
- 207 could run inside containers as well as VMs. It is a potential candidate for SaaS-based offerings,
- just like VMs and containers. Its portability allows applications to run anywhere, making it an
- 209 attractive option for various use cases.

- 210 The steps involved in developing a WASM module and running it using WASM runtime are [6]:
- Source code writing: Programs are written in languages (e.g., C++, C#, Rust, etc.) that
   have target WASM compilers available.
- **Parsing:** The code is parsed into an abstract syntax tree (AST) structure.
- Compiling: The code in AST structure is then compiled into a WASM module using AOT
   or JIT. The WASM module is generated in a binary format that can be executed by
   WASM runtime.
- WASM runtime loading: The WASM runtime loads the WASM module (with file name extension. wasm). If JIT is used, the compilation takes place after loading into WASM runtime.
- Preparation for execution (i.e., instantiation): The WASM runtime creates an
   executable instance from the WASM module by allocating memory, importing functions
   and objects, and establishing the execution environment for the module.
- Code optimization: During execution of the byte code, profiling is employed to identify
   frequently executed code, and a progressive optimization/re-optimization process takes
   place to gradually enhance performance until the code runs efficiently.
- Figure 1 shows the ability to develop programs in different languages, convert them into WASM code, and run them under different processor architectures [4]. The execution model for WASM modules in the server environment and their comparison with the container execution model
- 229 are described in Appendix B.
- 230



232

Fig. 1. Generating WASM modules and their execution [4]

### 233 **2.3. Proxies as WASM Platforms**

- 234 Proxies are increasingly being used as platforms for executing WASM modules. In cloud-native
- and microservices-based applications, proxies mediate inter-service communication. Open-
- source projects in proxies, such as Envoy, have extended their filter chain to allow for calling
- and executing WASM modules. These WASM modules can enforce policy-based authorizations
- or implement network resiliency measures, providing essential security controls for such
- applications. Additionally, the capabilities of these modules can be leveraged for data
- 240 protection purposes.
- 241 The advantages of network based WASM modules include:
- Extensibility: Proxies like Envoy can be extended with WASM modules, allowing
   developers to introduce custom logic and functionality without modifying the proxy's
   core codebase. This extensibility allows for the seamless integration of new features and
   capabilities.
- Security and isolation: WASM modules run in a sandboxed environment, providing
   isolation from the host system and other modules. This isolation enhances security by
   preventing unauthorized access to system resources and mitigating the impact of
   potential vulnerabilities.
- Portability: WebAssembly's portability ensures that WASM modules can run
   consistently across different proxy implementations and platforms, promoting a write once, run-anywhere approach.
- 4. Performance: WASM modules can potentially offer better performance compared to
   the traditional scripting languages used for proxy extensions since they can be compiled
   to efficient machine code.
- Policy enforcement and network resiliency: By executing WASM modules in proxies,
   organizations can enforce policies, implement authorization controls, and introduce
   network resiliency measures at the proxy level, ensuring consistent and centralized
   enforcement across distributed applications.
- 260 6. Data protection: WASM modules in proxies can be used to implement data filtering,
   261 transformation, or encryption mechanisms and ensure sensitive data protection as it
   262 flows through the proxy.
- 263
   7. Ecosystem and community: The growing WebAssembly ecosystem and community
   264 provide libraries, tools, and resources that foster collaboration and accelerate the
   265 development of proxy extensions and data protection solutions.
- As WASM continues to mature, its role in proxies will expand, enabling proxies to act as robust platforms for security and application logic execution. This evolution is particularly pertinent to data protection, which stands as a central theme of contemporary application development.

### 269 **2.4. Proxy-WASM**

- 270 Envoy Proxy, an open-source edge and service proxy, plays a pivotal role in managing the flow
- of traffic between microservices in many service mesh deployments. The collection of
- extensible APIs that it provides for various services is designated as xDS. An extension API that
- 273 leverages the extensibility of these basic, foundational APIs of Envoy Proxy is the WebAssembly
- 274 for Proxies (Proxy-WASM) runtime.
- 275 Proxy-WASM extends the adaptability of Envoy Proxy by enabling the deployment of
- 276 WebAssembly modules within the proxy server. This integration allows for the execution of
- 277 custom code directly within the proxy, providing a platform-independent and secure
- 278 environment. The modularity of WebAssembly makes it an ideal choice for extending the
- 279 functionalities of Envoy Proxy without the need for recompilation or significant changes to the
- 280 existing infrastructure.
- 281 The architecture of Proxy-WASM within Envoy Proxy allows for the seamless integration and
- 282 execution of custom logic at various stages of the request-response cycle. For example, a
- 283 WASM module can intercept requests, inspect payload data, apply data categorizations, and
- 284 redact data before proceeding. This level of granular control enhances the security posture of
- 285 microservices architectures while maintaining performance and scalability.
- 286 Proxy-WASM can be leveraged to implement robust security measures for microservices
- 287 communication. WASM modules can perform tasks, such as data categorization and mitigation
- 288 directly within the proxy.

## 289 **2.4.1. Role of WASM in Different Service Mesh Architectures**

- 290 Service mesh architectures have traditionally utilized sidecar proxies, which are implemented as
- 291 containers and deployed alongside each service within a Kubernetes pod. These sidecar proxies
- 292 manage both inbound and outbound traffic for their respective services, creating an ideal
- 293 WASM-based insertion point for in-transit categorization.
- 294 Additionally, newer architectural patterns (e.g., proxy implementation/deployment models)
- 295 recognize that sidecar proxies are excessive because many services do not have L7-level
- services. The ambient waypoint proxy pattern seeks to simplify the sidecar model by
- 297 centralizing and simplifying traffic management and policy enforcement. In this pattern,
- 298 waypoint proxies are deployed at the node level, which provides application services either per
- 299 namespace or per service account. They manage all ingress and egress traffic for the services
- 300 within their designated scope. In both proxy deployment models, the WebAssembly VM
- 301 intercepts and analyzes traffic in the exact same way, providing a transparent deployment for
- 302 WASM-based data categorization policies and modules.
- 303 Outside of traditional Envoy-based service mesh proxies, there are several runtime
- 304 environments where WASM modules can be deployed to classify sensitive data in transit. Many
- 305 API gateways now support WASM along with commercial content delivery network (CDN)
- 306 platforms, such as Fastly's WASM Compute Platform and Cloudflare's WASM Workers.

### 307 2.5. WASI-HTTP

- 308 With its application binary interface (ABI), Proxy-WASM facilitates communication between
- 309 WebAssembly modules and host environments, specifically proxies. It has a mature
- 310 specification adopted by various proxy servers and traces its origins to efforts within the Envoy
- 311 project to extend the capabilities of proxy servers using WebAssembly. Proxy-WASM ensures
- 312 that extensions written for one proxy can be reused in others, promoting a write-once, run-
- anywhere approach. Proxy-WASM's ABI and event-driven streaming APIs have been
- 314 incorporated into several production-level proxies, demonstrating the project's practical
- 315 application and influence.
- In contrast, WASI-HTTP a WASM-based API has evolved through iterations to define
- 317 interfaces for handling HTTP requests and responses directly within WASM modules. It aims to
- 318 provide a minimal and streamlined execution environment for WebAssembly-based HTTP
- 319 proxies and is designed to seamlessly integrate with existing web infrastructure, such as service
- 320 workers and reverse proxies, without requiring a complex runtime system. WASI-HTTP is
- 321 already in production in some environments and supports scalable and dynamic WASM
- 322 instance creation in response to web traffic, laying the groundwork for future innovations like
- 323 linking HTTP intermediaries through the component model.
- 324 Both WASI-HTTP and Proxy-WASM are shaping the landscape of WebAssembly in networked
- and distributed systems. While WASI-HTTP is allowing for simplified HTTP communication
- 326 within WebAssembly applications, Proxy-WASM exemplifies the successful implementation of a
- 327 standardized interface across multiple proxy implementations. Their collaborative development
- 328 highlights a symbiotic relationship, with WASI-HTTP potentially leveraging Proxy-WASM's ABI to
- 329 further enhance the capabilities and reach of WebAssembly in networking scenarios.

### 330 **2.6. eBPF**

- 331 Using WASM to parse human-readable text in Layers 4–7 offers several advantages over
- technologies like eBPF, particularly regarding handling complex application-layer data, such as
- 333 HTTP. While eBPF is powerful for data capture and manipulation directly within the kernel, its
- use for parsing detailed HTTP traffic can be complex and potentially excessive for some
- applications. This complexity stems from the need to handle the intricacies of HTTP within the
- kernel a task that can restrict performance and introduce security concerns if not managed
- 337 correctly. Additionally, eBPF imposes numerous restrictions and requires extra effort for data
- 338 processing and general-purpose computation.
- 339 WASM provides a secure, sandboxed environment that is suitable for efficiently executing code
- across multiple platforms and parsing application-layer protocols. WASM can be used in user
- 341 spaces and server environments, allow easier integration with existing parsing libraries and
- tools, reduce complexity, and potentially enhance the reliability of parsing operations. Its
   portability and ability to embed in various runtime environments make it a practical choice for
- network traffic analysis tasks, including those involving protocols that handle human-readable
- 144 network trainc analysis tasks, including those involving protocols that handle human-read

### 346 **3. Data Protection in Transit**

- One of the first and most fundamental tasks in data protection is classifying data to identify the
- 348 need for further operations (e.g., sanitization, filtering, etc.).

### 349 3.1. Data Categorization Techniques

- 350 Data in transit can vary wildly between structured and unstructured formats. For real-time
- 351 categorization and protection, care must be taken to formulate the right approach. The
- 352 performance of each categorization event is critical to ensuring that minimal latency is added as
- 353 the process takes place. By executing WASM modules in proxies, organizations can implement
- data categorization and filtering mechanisms at the proxy level. This approach allows for the
- 355 identification and protection of sensitive data as it flows between services.
- 356 Regex and ML models can be used within these WASM modules to detect patterns and classify
- data in real time, enabling the implementation of appropriate data protection measures, such
- 358 as redaction, encryption, or access control policies. Regex matching can identify complex
- 359 patterns for nuanced categorization schemes, and ML tools can detect patterns that signify
- 360 categorization attributes. This latter process involves classifying a set of example data and
- training one or more models to analyze and classify future data. Though it is potentially the
- 362 most effective automatic categorization method, it requires significant setup and management.
- The training data sets must be comprehensive to provide ample information for accurate categorization detection.
- 365 Unlike other data categorization techniques that operate on data at rest, in-transit
- 366 categorization provides the added dimension of time as traffic is analyzed. When combining
- data categorization with the time it was accessed or sent, data flows can be visualized and
- 368 understood. Once models have been trained on normal data flow patterns, it becomes clear
- 369 when a violation in data access has occurred or when an unpermitted data flow has been
- 370 established. By leveraging the capabilities of WASM modules in proxies, organizations can gain
- 371 visibility into data flows, detect anomalies, and take proactive measures to protect sensitive
- data as it moves between services in cloud-native and microservices-based applications.

# 373 **3.2. Techniques for Data Protection**

- 374 This section describes the practical uses of the data protection techniques dynamic data
- 375 masking (DDM), user and entity behavior analytics (UEBA), and data loss prevention (DLP)
- 376 within WASM modules in various application scenarios with a focus on the domain data that
- 377 pertains to each application scenario.

# 378 **3.2.1. Web Traffic Data Protection**

- 379 In-transit data categorization across web protocols like HTTP/2 and gRPC enable the
- observability of data flows between services and clients. By classifying data in motion,
- 381 organizations can monitor how sensitive information is accessed by both unauthenticated and

authenticated identities. WASM modules can use regex and ML models to identify sensitive

data patterns in HTTP payloads and redact, mask, or block classified data transmissions based
 on configured policies. Example applications include:

- E-commerce websites: Monitoring credit card details and personal information during
   transactions to ensure that they are properly encrypted and masked, preventing
   unauthorized access.
- Healthcare applications: Protecting patient data by detecting and encrypting sensitive
   information, such as medical records and personal identifiers before they are
   transmitted between systems.
- Corporate communications: Scanning and securing internal emails and messages to
   prevent data breaches and ensure compliance with internal data protection policies.

### 393 3.2.2. API Security

APIs are critical conduits for sensitive data and are often targeted for attacks. Monitoring data
 transmitted to and from APIs is essential for detecting vulnerabilities, such as application-level
 DDoS attacks, SQL injection, or data exfiltration. Many API gateways and service meshes
 support running WASM modules for enhanced security. These modules can implement
 authentication, rate limiting, and payload inspection for API traffic. Example applications
 include:

- Financial services: Protecting API endpoints that handle financial transactions by
   detecting and blocking SQL injection attempts and unauthorized access attempts.
- Social media platforms: Monitoring data flow through APIs to prevent the exfiltration of
   user data and ensure that sensitive information, such as login credentials and personal
   messages, are protected.
- 405 IoT devices: Securing data transmitted from IoT devices to backend systems and detecting anomalies in data patterns that might indicate a security breach.

### 407 **3.2.3. Microsegmentation**

408 In microsegmentation, in-transit data categorization enhances asset inventory reporting. This

advanced categorization enables organizations to identify and track critical assets and their

410 data flows to ensure alignment with data protection policies. This granular insight is especially

- valuable for assets that handle PII or financial data, bolstering data governance and complianceefforts.
- 413 While Kubernetes (K8s) networking policies offer segmentation, managing and testing these
- 414 policies can be resource intensive. Traditional network policies rely on static rule sets that
- 415 require meticulous configuration and maintenance. Comprehensive testing across dynamic
- 416 environments poses operational challenges, and these policies lack granular visibility into data
- 417 content, making it difficult to accurately differentiate between legitimate and malicious traffic.

- 418 In contrast, in-transit data categorization offers a dynamic and granular approach. By analyzing
- data flows in real time, organizations gain actionable insights into the content and context of
- 420 network traffic. This enables the precise enforcement of security controls based on data
- 421 attributes, such as sensitivity levels or compliance requirements. Example applications include:
- Financial institutions: Implementing microsegmentation to protect critical systems that
   handle transaction processing to ensure that only authorized services can access
   sensitive financial data.
- Healthcare providers: Segregating networks within a hospital to ensure that medical
   devices and patient data systems are isolated from less secure administrative networks.
- Retail chains: Using real-time data categorization to manage data flows between point of-sale systems and backend inventory systems to prevent unauthorized access to sales
   data and customer information.

### 430 **3.2.4. Log Traffic Data Protection**

- 431 Regulated organizations often face the challenge of sensitive data leaking into log streams.
- 432 Since all log protocols operate at Layer 4 and traverse service proxies within a service mesh,
- addressing potential leaks at their source allows organizations to secure data before it disperses
  into various storage systems, effectively mitigating the risk of exposure.
- 435 Example applications include:
- Financial services: Ensuring that transaction logs do not contain unmasked credit card
   numbers or personal identification information to prevent accidental leaks.
- Healthcare providers: Protecting patient data in system logs by redacting sensitive
   information before it is stored or transmitted to logging systems.
- E-commerce platforms: Monitoring and sanitizing log data to prevent the exposure of customer order details and personal information.

### 442 **3.2.5. LLM Traffic Data Protection**

- Due to their scalability needs, large language models (LLMs) typically operate within service
  mesh architectures. Classifying both prompt and response data in transit is crucial for
  governance. This enables organizations to maintain visibility over the data flows of deployed
  LLMs and ensure compliance with regulatory standards and organizational policies for data
  protection.
- 448 Example applications include:
- 449 Customer support systems: Monitoring interactions between customers and automated
   450 support bots to ensure that sensitive customer data is not inadvertently exposed or
   451 logged.

- 452 Content Moderation: Ensuring that data processed by LLMs for content moderation is
   453 handled in compliance with privacy regulations to protect user information.
- Data Analysis Services: Classifying and securing data used by LLMs in analytics platforms
   to prevent unauthorized access to sensitive business insights and customer data.

### 456 **3.2.6. Credit Card-Related Data Protection**

WASM modules are also used to protect data related to credit card transactions, as laid out in
 PCI DSS 4.0 specifications. This is achieved by incorporating the following functions into WASM
 modules:

- Clearly identify and document all areas in which sensitive data (e.g., cardholder data, authentication values, encryption keys, etc.) is stored, processed, or transmitted. This includes databases, servers, applications, and network segments that handle card holder data.
- Generate data-flow diagrams or other technical or topological solutions that identify
   flows of account data across systems and networks.

Identify all data flows for the various stages of payment transactions (e.g., authorization, capture settlement, chargebacks, and refunds) and acceptance channels (e.g., card
 present, card not present, and e-commerce).

### 469 **3.2.7. Monitoring Tools to Visualize Sensitive Data Flows**

470 WASM modules can also be programmed to collect and emit metrics and telemetry data in

- 471 various formats to monitoring tools that are used to visualize the flow of sensitive data (e.g.,
- 472 Prometheus, Grafana etc.). By examining the normal rate of sensitive data flow over time,
- 473 visual indicators, such as spikes, can be used to identify data leakage incidents and
- 474 unauthorized data exposures. Subsequent investigations can then ensure compliance with data
- 475 protection regulations and reduce the risk of continued data breaches.

#### 477 4. Security Analysis of WASM Modules

- 478 To realize the security goals for which the WASM modules are deployed, the whole ecosystem 479 under which these modules execute must obey the properties of a security kernel:
- 480 1. It is always invoked (i.e., non-bypassable).
- 481 2. It is small and verifiable.
- 482 Consider the satisfaction of the first property in the context of two proxy implementation
- models in a service mesh. In the sidecar proxy model, a proxy is implemented as a container 483
- 484 that coexists with each microservice in the same pod and runs in the same network space as
- 485 the service. All traffic coming into and emanating from the microservice must pass through the
- 486 proxy and the applications running inside of the proxy. Hence, the WASM module that provides 487 the data protection function deployed inside the proxy will always be invoked.
- 488 In the ambient proxy implementation model, the network link to a service or group of services
- 489 associated with a namespace has to pass through the node hosting the waypoint proxy serving
- 490 that service or group of services for a designated namespace. No direct network paths to the service or group of services exists. Again, the WASM module provides data protection for
- 491
- 492 services under the scope of the proxy has to be invoked.
- 493 To meet the second property of the security kernel (i.e., the security is verifiable), a security
- 494 analysis of the entire execution environment for the WASM modules must be performed. The
- 495 life cycle of a WASM module begins with a source code in some supported language (e.g., C,
- 496 C++, or Rust) that is then compiled using a target compiler (e.g., using LLVM) into a binary byte
- 497 code that is run by a runtime module (i.e., WASM runtime). Access to the operating system or
- 498 host resources is enabled by calling a module that implements an API called WASM System
- 499 Interface (WASI).
- 500 The security analysis of the WebAssembly ecosystem can be considered in terms of the 501 following topics:
- 502 1. WASM security goals and security feature sets
- 503 2. Memory model and memory safety
- 504 3. Execution model and control flow integrity
- 505 4. Security of API access to OS/host resources
- 5. Protection against side-channel attacks 506
- 507 6. Protection against injection attacks
- 508 7. Deployment and operating safety

#### 509 4.1. WASM Security Goals and Security Feature Sets

- 510 The WASM security model has two important goals: (1) protect users from buggy or malicious
- 511 modules, and (2) provide *developers* with useful primitives and mitigations for developing safe
- 512 applications within the constraints of (1)[8].

### 513 4.1.1. User-Level Security Features

- 514 Each WASM module executes within a sandboxed environment that is separated from the host 515 runtime using fault isolation techniques. This implies that:
- Applications execute independently and cannot escape the sandbox without going
   through appropriate APIs.
- Applications generally execute deterministically with limited exceptions.
- 519 Additionally, each module is subject to the security policies of its embedding. Within a web
- 520 browser, this includes restrictions on information flow through same-origin policy. On a non-
- 521 web platform, this could include the POSIX security model.

### 522 **4.1.2. Security Primitives for Developers**

523 The design of WebAssembly promotes safe programs by eliminating dangerous features from 524 its execution semantics while maintaining compatibility with programs written for C/C++. 525 Modules must declare all accessible functions and their associated types at load time, even 526 when dynamic linking is used. This allows for the implicit enforcement of control-flow 527 integrity (CFI) through structured control flow. Since compiled code is immutable and not 528 observable at runtime, WebAssembly programs are protected from control flow hijacking 529 attacks.

- Function calls must specify the index of a target that corresponds to a valid entry in
   the function index space or table index space.
- Indirect function calls are subject to a type of signature check at runtime, and the type
   signature of the selected indirect function must match the type signature specified at
   the call site.
- A protected call stack that is invulnerable to buffer overflows in the module heap
   ensures safe function returns.
- Branches must point to valid destinations within the enclosing function.

### 538 **4.2. Memory Model and Memory Safety**

- 539 As there are only four primary data types defined by WASM, compilers targeting WASM
- 540 implement their own stack in an area called linear memory, which becomes the main memory
- of a WASM program. A linear memory is a contiguous, byte-addressable range of memory that
- 542 can be considered as an untyped array of bytes. This enables the program to store non-scalar
- 543 data and any variable whose address needs to be taken by the module [10]. In addition to linear
- 544 memory, there is the code space, execution stack, and runtime data structure [11]. The 545 execution stack mainly stores local variables, global variables, and return addresses.
- 546 Compilers that target WASM also create an area for the heap in the linear memory. This area is 547 reserved at the end of the linear memory so that it can dynamically grow when additional space 548 is allocated for the linear memory. This linear memory is sandboxed — disjointed from code

- 549 space, execution stack, and runtime data structure [11] and prevents WASM modules from
- 550 accessing other memory areas. These other memory regions are isolated from the internal
- 551 memory of the runtime and are set to zero by default unless otherwise initialized. However,
- 552 modules can access the data stored on the execution stack via dedicated instructions. The
- actual data address on the execution stack is never shown to the module. A compliant runtime
- ensures that the module does not break WASM's memory model [12]. This is done by bounds-
- checking access to the linear memory at the region level. If the module accesses the memory
- outside of the linear memory, the program traps and prevents modules from accessing data
- 557 outside of their allocated memory [11].
- 558 Another common class of memory safety error involves unsafe pointer usage and undefined
- behavior. This includes dereferencing pointers to unallocated memory (e.g., NULL) or freed
- memory allocations. In WebAssembly, the semantics of pointers have been eliminated for
   function calls and variables with a fixed static scope, allowing references to invalid indexes in
- 562 any index space to trigger a validation error at load time or at worst a trap at runtime.
- 563 However, the bounds-checking process is performed at the level of the linear memory, and
- 564 modules can access the entire linear memory without restriction. Linear memory is not
- 565 protected by standard techniques like stack canaries or guard pages. Therefore, buffer
- 566 overflows which occur when data exceeds the boundaries of an object and accesses adjacent
- 567 memory regions cannot affect local or global variables stored in index space. Data stored in
- 568 linear memory can also overwrite adjacent objects since bounds-checking is performed at linear
- 569 memory region granularity and is not context-sensitive.

## 570 **4.3. Execution Model and Control Flow Integrity**

- 571 WASM code is executed when instantiating a module or when an exported function is invoked
- 572 on a given instance [12]. The execution behavior of a WASM module is defined in terms of an
- 573 abstract machine that models the program state. This abstract machine includes a stack that
- records the operand values and control constructs as well as an abstract store that contains the
- 575 global state.
- 576 WASM primarily achieves control flow integrity through the execution semantics of the
- 577 language itself. The definition of the WASM bytecode [12] limits the constructs that are
- 578 possible to express. It defines valid code constructs and how control flow may only jump to the
- 579 beginning of a valid construct. Arbitrary jumps (e.g., goto statements) are not allowed; only
- 580 structured control flow is provided. Consequently, a grammatically valid WASM module can
- only jump to the beginning of valid constructs (e.g., conditional constructs or functions) [11].
- 582 An additional factor contributing to the control flow integrity is the prevention of call
- redirection through restrictions on indirect function calls. Restrictions are applied regarding
- 584 functions that the module can indirectly call. To indirectly call a function, the module provides a
- runtime index to a table. This table holds the signatures of the functions that the module
- 586 defines or imports and that can be indirectly called. When an indirect call is made, the runtime
- 587 checks that the calling signature and the signature of the called function match. If there is a
- 588 type mismatch or an out-of-bounds table access, a trap occurs [11].

### 589 **4.4. Security of API Access to OS and Host Resources**

- 590 By default, WASM does not have access to the resources of the host (e.g., file system, network,
- 591 system calls). Modules can import externally defined functions provided by the host or other
- 592 modules. APIs common to many use cases are currently being standardized in the WASI [13].
- 593 The capability-based security model of WASI enables the introduction of a verified secure
- runtime system, as shown in [14].

### 595 **4.5. Protection From Side-Channel Attacks**

- 596 The WASM language specification [12] clearly states that side-channel attacks are to be
- addressed by the runtime. Currently, Wasmtime implements a few forms of Spectre
- 598 mitigations. Bounds checks for the runtime index used in indirect calls and some other
- instructions are mitigated to ensure that speculation goes to a deterministic place [15].
- 600 However, some side-channel attacks can occur, such as timing attacks against modules.
- 601 In the future, additional protections may be provided by runtimes or the toolchain, such as
- 602 code diversification or memory randomization like addressing space layout
- 603 randomization (ASLR) or bounded pointers (i.e., "fat" pointers).

### 604 **4.6.** Protection Against Code Injection and Other Attacks

- 605 Control-flow integrity and protected call stacks prevent direct code injection attacks. Thus,
- 606 common mitigations, such as data execution prevention (DEP) and stack smashing
- 607 protection (SSP), are not needed by WASM programs. Nevertheless, other classes of bugs are
- not obviated by the semantics of WebAssembly. Although attackers cannot perform direct code
- 609 injection attacks, it is possible to hijack the control flow of a module using code reuse attacks
- against indirect calls. However, conventional return-oriented programming (ROP) attacks using
- 611 short sequences of instructions (i.e., "gadgets") are not possible in WebAssembly because
- 612 control-flow integrity ensures that call targets are valid functions declared at load time.
- 613 Likewise, race conditions, such as time-of-check to time-of-use (TOCTOU) vulnerabilities, are
- 614 possible in WebAssembly since no execution or scheduling guarantees are provided beyond in-
- order execution. Yet another security limitation is that there are no audit tools to track the
- 616 changes made by WASM modules.

## 617 **4.7. Deployment and Operating Security**

- The security features described so far pertaining to run time security. The following capabilitiesrelate to the controls that are present for deployment and integrity of operations.
- The ability to create the WASM filter in the proxy can be controlled through the native
   access mechanism in the service mesh (e.g., RBAC).
- Only calls using HTTP and gRPC protocols are allowed.

- Even for making those calls, only clusters known to the proxy can be used. Similarly,
- 624 responses coming from clusters already known to the proxy are examined.

### 626 **5. Summary and Conclusions**

- 627 This document describes how WASM modules can be developed and deployed in service mesh
- 628 proxies for the real-time protection of data in transit in cloud-native application architectures.
- 629 Various data protection techniques can also be used to protect data in different domains of
- 630 various application scenarios. WASM modules can provide telemetry data for monitoring tools
- that provide visual images of sensitive data flows. A detailed security analysis of the WASM
- 632 module development, deployment, and execution environment can ensure that necessary
- 633 security assurances are obtained by running the modules as part of the application
- 634 infrastructure environment (e.g., in service mesh proxies).
- 635 The data categorization and protection techniques built into WASM modules must continuously
- 636 evolve to keep pace with increasingly sophisticated attacks on data that result in new forms of
- 637 data breaches, data leakages, and other forms of data exfiltration.

# 639 References

640	[1]	Doerrfeld B (2023) Wasm: The Next Generation Beyond Kubernetes? Available at
641		https://cloudnativenow.com/features/wasm-the-next-generation-beyond-
642		kubernetes/?utm_medium=email&_hsmi=293085224&_hsenc=p2ANgtz-9glZw1MWD8-
643		AHNH54OoPyWB7vOLe0uG0KZSIe2uH1sbXAD rmmhyXHMThd0GMdMLUb-
644		w8axL Gv1L2RM9Nq55L2eCysg&utm content=293086040&utm source=hs email
645	[2]	Krasnov M (2020) Web Assembly is the End of Internet as we know it. Available at
646		https://betterprogramming.pub/webassembly-is-the-end-of-the-internet-as-we-know-
647		it-9085a49cbc7b
648	[3]	WebAssembly (2024) WebAssembly Concepts, Available at
649	[-]	https://developer.mozilla.org/en-US/docs/WebAssembly/Concepts#see_also
650	[4]	TechTarget (2022) Server-side WebAssembly prepares for takeoff in 2023. Available at
651		https://www.techtarget.com/searchitoperations/news/252527414/Server-side-
652		WebAssembly-prepares-for-takeoff-in-2023
653	[5]	Medium (2023) WASM and Kubernetes – A new era of application development.
654	[-]	Available at https://medium.com/@seifeddineraihi/wasm-and-kubernetes-a-new-era-
655		of-cloud-native-application-deployment-b3c59b39f640
656	[6]	Podobnik TJ (2023) WASM Runtimes Vs Containers: Cold Start Delays (Part 1). Available
657	[-]	at https://levelup.gitconnected.com/wasm-runtimes-vs-containers-performance-
658		evaluation-part-1-454cada7da0b
659	[7]	ITPro (2024) WASM Today, AI Tomorrow: KubeCon Extends its Reach, Available at
660	r. 1	https://www.itprotoday.com/cloud-computing-and-edge-computing/wasm-today-ai-
661		tomorrow-kubecon-expands-its-
662		reach? mc=NL DR EDT 20240401&cid=NL DR EDT 20240401&utm rid=CPNET000
663		059406774&utm_campaign=57716&utm_medium=email&elg2=a6cba5014e5b49bb9a1
664		fe0c3e0351bd2&sp_eh=87aea8874bbd0a1985055c93c957744c11570c6718777eca378d
665		b1b4436de815
666	[8]	Security.md (2018) WebAssembly Security. Available at
667		https://github.com/WebAssembly/design/blob/main/Security.md
668	[9]	Huang W, Paradies M (2021) An Evaluation of WebAssembly and eBPF as Offloading
669		Mechanisms in the Context of Computational Storage. Available at
670		https://marcusparadies.github.io/files/ebpf_vs_wasm_report.pdf
671	[10]	Daniel Lehmann D, Kinder J, and Pradel M. (2020). Everything Old is New Again: Binary
672		Security of WebAssembly. In USENIX Security
673	[11]	Haas A., et all (2017). Bringing the web up to speed with WebAssembly. In PLDI.
674	[12]	WebAssembly Community Group (2023). WebAssembly Specification. Draft Release 2.0
675		(Draft 2023-04-24). Available at https://webassembly.github.io/spec/
676	[13]	WebAssembly Community Group (2023). WebAssembly System Interface. Available at
677		https://github.com/WebAssembly/WASI
678	[14]	Johnson E., et all (2023). WaVe: A verifiably secure WebAssembly sandboxing runtime.
679		In Proceedings of IEEE Symposium on Security and Privacy (SP).
680	[15]	Wasmtime (2023). Security - Wasmtime. Available at
681		https://docs.wasmtime.dev/security.html

NIST IR 8505 ipd (Initial Public Draft) June 2024

### 682 Appendix A. Execution Model for Web Assembly in Browsers

- 683 WASM runtime originated with browsers that enabled the running of native code (i.e., code
- 684 written in low-level languages such as C, C++, Rust, etc.).



# 685



### Fig. 2. WASM Module Development & Execution in Browsers

The WebAssembly program is run through a compiler (also called a WebAssembly target

688 compiler) that inputs code into an LLVM-compliant language and produces a binary .wasm file.

That file is loaded onto the existing JavaScript code by the JavaScript Interop layer and executed by the WebAssembly runtime [2]. The .wasm file is a low-level assembly language file in binary

- 691 format.
- 692 The WASM compiler for C, C++, and Rust takes the source code written in those languages and

693 compiles it into a WASM module. Then the necessary JavaScript "glue" code is generated for

694 loading and running the module and an HTML document is used to display the results of the

695 code. The details of this process are explained in [3].

### 697 Appendix B. Comparison of Execution Models for Containers and WASM Modules





### Fig. 3. Comparison of Execution Stack for Containers & WASM Modules

Container images are created by combining the program containing the application logic with
its dependencies (e.g., runtime libraries) in a container runtime (e.g., docker). The container is a
full file system (i.e., utilities, binary), and the generated image should be for a designated OS
kernel and processor architecture (e.g., Intel, Arm, etc.). For example, if a Raspberry Pi OS is
running a docker image, then an image for the C/C++ application based on a Linux image must
be created and compiled for the ARM processor architecture. Otherwise, then container will not

- run as expected [5].
- 707 In contrast, WASM modules and binaries are precompiled C/C++ applications that do not rely
- on being coupled with a host OS or system architecture because they do not contain a
- precompiled file system or low-level OS primitives. Every directory and system resource is
- attached to a WASM module during runtime facilitated by WASI and then run using WASM
- runtime. In other words, WASI is used to access all resources under the control of the OS,
- essentially decoupling the code from its dependency on the platform architecture.
- 713